

# **2005 Workshop on Humiliation and Violent Conflict Representing the Sixth Annual Human Dignity and Humiliation Studies Meeting**

15-16<sup>th</sup> December  
New York, NY  
Teacher's College, Columbia University

## **Meeting Notes Day 2**

**Please be advised that these notes are marked as 'Unconfirmed'**  
**Please advise the HumanDHS website admin if there are any errors**



Unco

## Contents

Day Two, December 16, 2005

**Humiliation Dynamic: Looking Back...Looking Forward ..... 4**

**Is Humiliation Relevant in a Destructive Conflict? (Round Table 2; Section 2) ..... 4**

- I. A Theoretical Understanding of How Emotions Fuel Intractable Conflict: The Case of Humiliation (Jennifer Goldman)..... 5
  - II. A Woman in Berlin: The Complexity of Humiliation at the End of World War II (Anne Wyatt-Brown) ..... 5
  - III. Six Research Designs on Humiliation (Floyd Webster Rudmin) ..... 5
  - IV. The Dual Humiliation of Female Refugees by Sexually Violent, Gender-based Acts (Miriam Marton)..... 6
  - V. Cognitive and Emotional Ingroup-identification of Youth in Israel and Palestine (Sophie Schaarschmidt) ..... 6
- Discussion on Is Humiliation Relevant in a Destructive Conflict? ..... 7

**Can the Notion of Humiliation be Useful for Public Policy Planning? What can we Envisage as Best Practice Models? (Round Table 3; Section 1) ..... 9**

- I. Developing a Survey with the Aim to Create a Humiliation Index for Every Country (Alan B. Slifka)..... 9
- II. Humiliation, Crime and Justice (Howard Zehr)..... 10
- III. From Humiliation to Empowerment: The Arts in Retributive and Restorative Justice (Kjell Skyllstad) ..... 10
- IV. The “School for Peace”: A Conflict Resolution Program in Jewish-Palestinian Village (Grace Feuerverger) ..... 11
- V. Horizontal Inequality and Humiliation: Public Policy for Disaffection or Cohesion? (Gay Rosenblum-Kumar)..... 11
- VI. Dignity-Humiliation in the Case of Internally Displaced Persons in Latin America: The Examples of Colombia, Guatemala, Peru, and Mexico (Mercedes Gonzales Jauregui)..... 11
- VII. Compassion, Dignity and Peace Education: A Case Study from Children of War, Inc. (Judith Thompson) ..... 12

**Can the Notion of Humiliation be Useful for Public Policy Planning? What can we Envisage as Best Practice Models?(Round Table 3; Section 2) ..... 14**

- I. Reflection on Policy and Humiliation: Addressing the Needs of Poor Minority Children in New Jersey’s Public Schools (Philip Brown) ..... 14
- II. The Subversion of the Colonial System of Humiliation: A Case Study of the Gandhian Strategy (Rina Kashyap)..... 14
- III. Reconciliation as Policy: Moving Beyond the Victim-Perpetrator Lens in the United Nations Secretariat and Member States (Sarah Sayeed) ..... 15

IV. Mediated Humiliations: Spectacles of Power in Postmodern Culture (Myra Mendible)..... 15

V. Addressing Humiliation through Listening with Respect: A Restorative Justice Model for Victims, Offenders, and Law Enforcement (Ariel Lublin)..... 15

VI. Humiliation, Retaliation, and Violence (Neil Altman)..... 16

Unconfirmed See page 1

## Day Two December 16, 2005

---

### ***Humiliation Dynamic: Looking Back....Looking Forward***

Presentation by Donald Klein, Graduate College, the Union Institute and University, USA, please see <http://www.humiliationstudies.org/documents/KleinLookingBackForward.pdf>.

Don - Evelin gave me the task of looking to the past and looking to the future. This paper feels a bit outdated after the discussions of the past day.

I am confused about how to differentiate between shame and humiliation or whether to differentiate at all. Humiliation does something for us, as well as too us. A related set is needed to study those who inflict humiliation and why they do it....

Discussion:

Judith Thompson comments - I am struck by the personal journey and how it parallels Buddhist thought. Emptiness of self is the most important feature for developing compassion and understanding suffering.

Don - Yes this is all illusion, let's try to get behind. There is one thing to warn about: when we are in an imperialistic society, we have a tendency to romanticize the exotic. Not all Eastern religion is pacifist. Thoreau points out that community means "with munitions," which relates to safety. People have a tendency to retell humiliation as comedy (recreation and humor.) In retrospect we can see it was comic. Humor is often used as a tool for fighting humiliation

Rick - In NYC we see an example of humiliation going on right now. The President of a Union was saying that he was humiliated.

### ***Is Humiliation Relevant in a Destructive Conflict? (Round Table 2; Section 2)***

This Section of the Round Table contains the following presentations:

- I. A Theoretical Understanding of How Emotions Fuel Intractable Conflict: The Case of Humiliation
- II. A Woman in Berlin: The Complexity of Humiliation at the End of World War II
- III. Six Research Designs on Humiliation
- IV. The Dual Humiliation of Female Refugees by Sexually Violent, Gender-based Acts
- V. Cognitive and Emotional Ingroup-identification of Youth in Israel and Palestine

## **I. A Theoretical Understanding of How Emotions Fuel Intractable Conflict: The Case of Humiliation (Jennifer Goldman)**

Humiliation has been documented by people like Evelin and Thomas Friedman, and has been instrumental in perpetuating intractable conflict (e.g. in International levels, interpersonal levels). Often humiliation is central in perpetuating these situations, but in other cases it is not. What are the reasons why it sometimes pushes conflict forward and sometimes not? We need to view these situations from a cultural point of view. We can look at reactions to the same event across cultures and see why people are reacting in different ways. I am studying social norms. The third type of reason for different reactions is 'situational events' (e.g. you may think you are an intellectual, but you aren't). There is a theory that collective level humiliation leads to stronger reactions. Another aspect of this looks at how people get stuck in this over time - how is it that people ruminate about it? How much do they think about it, and how do they think about it?

## **II. A Woman in Berlin: The Complexity of Humiliation at the End of World War II (Anne Wyatt-Brown)**

Sometimes you get the impression that humiliation is a simple thing between humiliated, humiliator and witness, but it is more complicated, and goes back and forth between the parties.

Antony Biva thinks she was not damaged by the experience of being brutally raped by Russian soldiers where she developed gallows humor, which saved her. I beg to differ. The women in Berlin supported each other. In the 50s, her diary was published, and she thought that her fiancé Gerd would read the diary and understand her better. She saw herself as a trophy being passed back and forth, some sort of lower being. Her fiancé accused her of being immoral and left. He must have felt humiliated.

## **III. Six Research Designs on Humiliation (Floyd Webster Rudmin)**

Interpersonal humiliation, collective humiliation: figuring out mechanisms will be complicated.

We should examine the intentions of the humiliator. I am not sure that you need the intention to hurt in order to humiliate.

The New Testament example would be the crucifixion. Jesus is being mocked, and the intention is to humiliate, but he is not humiliated. This brings up the question of status. In order for "effective" humiliation you must be near the same status. If the status is too high, you are not within peer range. Humiliation is a process. At the start we are more or less equal, but we humiliate to make someone less.

One could not humiliate an autistic person; it has to be a social interaction. People with CP or aphasia are often humiliated because their verbal abilities are low.

I think it would be hard to humiliate a comedian because they would have mechanisms to use that the humiliation.

To shift to the group level - if a man, or a white man, or a psychologist, or a Canadian were humiliated, that would not necessarily trigger empathy, or humiliation

We almost need a humiliability scale.

To think in the extreme abstract, think of robots. How would you program a robot to be humiliable? You could figure out a lot by this.

#### **IV. The Dual Humiliation of Female Refugees by Sexually Violent, Gender-based Acts (Miriam Marton)**

I do not feel that we can talk about conflict and humiliation without talking about gender.

1. If a spouse is murdered and the remaining spouse is financially dependent there are issues.

2. Losing a child in war

3. There is a dual humiliation of rape victims. Women's bodies are the tool used to inflict humiliation on the other. But in this case the spoils also go to the victor. I think that women around the world are saying "this is enough." Peacemakers and new government still consist of just men. We must continue to address these issues and women must be the ones drafting, and signing documents.

#### **V. Cognitive and Emotional Ingroup-identification of Youth in Israel and Palestine (Sophie Schaarschmidt)**

I have worked with youth camps and conflict resolution workshops. I look at pride and shame dynamics, and work on collecting their stories of humiliation. I set up an internet forum for 7 days to discuss how they want to live their future. Separately? One state or two states? I wanted the youth to think for themselves and not have the government perspective there.

Going to a camp, national identity is already established. During the forum, they were to write private diaries, documenting how they feel about being part of this dialogue.

What I did was, I looked at diaries, looked at the forum, and did interviews with the youth. However, this meant that I got the reaction and did not see the feelings behind. If with to do more in the process, I will meet their needs. This is all voluntary, and anyone

can leave anytime; the internet discussion will be anonymous. I chose this format because of the opportunity to privately express emotions, rather than being constrained in the peace camp.

---

### ***Discussion on Is Humiliation Relevant in a Destructive Conflict?***

Stephanie – There is the example of Saddam’s teeth being examined on TV. I wanted to see Saddam brought to justice, not humiliated.

Sharon Burde - I have been working in post-war communities for a couple of decades (specifically with Palestinian and Israeli Jews). There have been ways of bringing the two groups together for decades. The question is why have we not gotten further than we are; what are we missing?

Sophie - In these programs you get the moderate people, the people who are willing to talk. Already in these groups shame and humiliation exist. There is a difference between cognitively and emotionally understanding the other; cognitive is possible, emotional is difficult or impossible. People grow up with that in historical thinking.

Sharon – This brings us to national myths, and the role of humiliation in national myths. I think that it is very important

Floyd - A lot of this is psychologizing the issue. A lot of it is because Israel has military force outside its boundaries, while Palestinian tanks are not in Israel. Anything that has duration benefits the one with more resources. This can become a mechanism for the more powerful.

Jennifer - It is difficult to say. That is only one side.

Indian participant - When you give examples of Jesus, Ghandi, or Mandela not being humiliated, they did not feel the other was more powerful. They were self-transformed, self-actualized individuals.

Sri Lankan participant – I have had experiences of people being kept down for generations. This made it easy for them to be humiliated. Humiliation is related to power. It is important to look at how to relate humiliation studies with power dynamics. What are you trying to bring out of this workshop? There is nothing you can do by talking about it. How can you change, or how do you need to change power dynamics?

Jennifer - As far as helping people rise up against their oppression, or helping people who are more powerful think about their actions, what does thinking or research do? For me, it has policy implications. People in the world of policy need to hear what I have to say.

Often those in power need/like to hear empirical data. Empirical data brought into conversation can help bring change.

Anne - Stories can be powerful in policy, too.

Floyd - When you get into agriculture you get into stratified societies with power differences - it becomes a prophylactic process.

Munir, Palestinian participant – I participated in some peace activities, conferences of NGOs and I was simply a man from the street. These activities are not really contributing, even though they are based on psychological theory to teach to live together. Discussions have activated feeling and broken some stereotypes. Yet, there is no grassroots movement of people feeling they can live together. The leap to create an actual movement would be to have this kind of peace work helped with those same theories alongside basic practical principles – namely equality, human rights. I do not participate in peace activities I am invited to now, because I want things based in equality. I want there to be a chance that a grassroots movement happens. Does someone have more rights than the other, does someone have to replace the other, live abroad because of the other? What happens when youth goes to camp and then goes back and joins the army?

Canadian participant – I feel that Israel is the demon. What I am hearing in my own field is: how do we solve the conflict when the state of Israel is not legitimate? How do we face that? They have already been condemned on some level - they are being measured with a different yardstick. It is heartbreaking and it is frightening because something bad could happen. Both groups of youth said that the Holocaust was the major issue. We have to consider the history of why Israel is where it is.

Judith Thompson - At a meeting in Berlin, discussion got to this same point – the same level of emotion. This emotion gives us ways to unpack some of this. What does healing look like? There is a mobilization of fear when there is a move toward grassroots change. We need to look at transgenerational healing. Groups working across the green line have successfully, after the second Intifada, evoked an empathic connection.

Miriam - I worry that Israelis have gone from being the victim to being the oppressor. How can one get out of victimhood without becoming an oppressor? They become stuck in the wounding.

Evelin - Going with good intentions can be humiliating. Love and help can also be humiliating, at times the worst. There is something about people feeling equal that those higher up cannot feel. Sometimes, humiliated people admire their humiliatees – this, to my view, even plays a key role in genocide.

I feel connected to the homeland of my parents (they were displaced in 1945/1946, ten million people were displaced, and in former centuries, I would have felt compelled to conquer it back for my family).

Don - Obviously there is a hell of a lot of stuff here. I worked with Louise Diamond with Turks and Greeks - a situation both unretractable, and unsolvable. Greeks forced to move to the north, and Turks to the south. There is no way to arrive at a solution that will be

equally acceptable to everyone - not to Turks and Greeks, or to the Turkish Government and the Greek Government. Any attempt at finding a simple solution is doubtful.

Louise Diamond, and a former US ambassador suggested that we should consider multi-tract diplomacy - the more tracts the better.

People who are low in power probably never invented Appreciative Inquiry and using it with the have-nots, they want to talk about the have-not and their situation. They want people to hear them in pain. Anyone involved in Appreciative Inquiry needs to keep this in mind.

***Can the Notion of Humiliation be Useful for Public Policy Planning? What can we Envisage as Best Practice Models? (Round Table 3; Section 1)***

This Section discusses the following topics:

- I. Developing a Survey with the Aim to Create a Humiliation Index for Every Country
- II. Humiliation, Crime and Justice
- III. From Humiliation to Empowerment: The Arts in Retributive and Restorative Justice
- IV. The "School for Peace": A Conflict Resolution Program in Jewish-Palestinian Village
- V. Horizontal Inequality and Humiliation: Public Policy for Disaffection or Cohesion?
- VI. Dignity-Humiliation in the Case of Internally Displace Persons in Latin America: The Examples of Colombia, Guatemala, Peru, and Mexico
- VII. Compassion, Dignity and Peace Education: A Case Study from Children of War, Inc.

**I. Developing a Survey with the Aim to Create a Humiliation Index for Every Country (Alan B. Slifka)**

I am looking for a way to help people interact. How do you create a world safe for difference? Having secure social bonds? We are all searching for a safe place and this is true - the goal of creating a safe place is universal. One of the issues in the world is that we have not agreed on what our goals are (e.g., environment became an important issue). In my mind, people living with difference should become a field of interest. We need to create a world where there is "peace in your house." Public policy issues, in my mind, are right on. Every government has to have an address, needs an address for coexistence (minister of environment, then minister of coexistence). There needs to be a manual for people who are going to formulate and carryout policies; we need to develop a manual for government people to use. Creating programs and projects that do not cost a lot of

money; I would submit that programs that enhance an anti-humiliation approach, are the core of programs that attain objectives. If we develop a coexistence manual, what is the vision, what is the goal, what are the broad policies for that? Creating a world safe for difference would be achievable. People here could be at the forefront of the coexistence movement. There is even a Masters program in coexistence in Brandeis. If you don't have a world safe for difference, it is no fun to live in it.

## **II. Humiliation, Crime and Justice (Howard Zehr)**

Our Western concept of justice is deeply humiliating. I hear a lot of language of shame and humiliation with victims and offenders. I am convinced that offending behavior is caused by shame, and most offenders act out of the sense of humiliation. Restorative justice is an effort to construct justice that is respectful. People will have to be involved and treat people in ways that recognize their value and worth, and address their needs. We need to find ways to hold people accountable, that both help them remove humiliation and transform with honor. We should encourage them to come forth with honor, which involves empathy. The topic of shame is a hot issue in restorative justice. Some feel that the function of justice is to shame people and that helps; other people feel that imposing shame backfires. We need to provide opportunities for eliminating shame. Shame can be positive if we reintegrate people. Shame is too difficult to manage; we should not be imposing it. Shame and humiliation relate as part of a family of affects – here we come up against the poverty of English and western thought - the Maori have 32 words for it.

## **III. From Humiliation to Empowerment: The Arts in Retributive and Restorative Justice (Kjell Skjellstad)**

How do we associate music and incarceration? Many associate music with prisoner abuse, and torture (e.g. orchestras of Nazi concentration camps, Balkan wars). There are other associations such as Johnny Cash, his record at Folsom, and his work for prison reform. We should explore the role of music in restorative justice, and performing arts in the role of restorative justice. Crime prevention choirs are in place in South Africa and the islands of Indonesia. People are feeling included once more.

In Europe, in the UK unit for arts and offenders - 94% of participants did not offend during projects. There was a 58% decrease in the 6 months after the project.

In Norway, 9 prisons involved with others are on the waiting list. A BBC program, Killers Don't Cry, found music to be a key in training. There is a transformation of prisons through music.

#### **IV. The “School for Peace”: A Conflict Resolution Program in Jewish-Palestinian Village (Grace Feuerverger)**

My book, *Oasis of Peace*, documented what is going on schools in a Jewish-Palestinian village. In 1991, I went to the Neve Shalom~Wahat al-Salam village to study the schools. It was not a professional journey, and became a personal journey. I lived there for months at a time over 10 years. The whole village is a sacred place; it is a safe place in the world. Peace is a reality in that village, but still a dream when you walk out of the village. In elementary schools, each classroom has a teacher from Palestine and Israel; both points of view are always heard. The School for Peace brings people from all over the country and the Gaza strip. The School opened the door to other villages. Mothers from both sides met each other. I got angry about why we do not see good things like that on the media. The meaning of the village may be more important than the village itself.

#### **V. Horizontal Inequality and Humiliation: Public Policy for Disaffection or Cohesion? (Gay Rosenblum-Kumar)**

My thinking has changed since I originally wrote my paper. I am looking at how intentional or unintentional actions of government create humiliation. Frances Stuart (Horizontal Inequality) stated that certain groups as a whole tend to have higher income and power than other groups. Governments do themselves a disservice intentionally or unintentionally. Groups feeling marginalized can rebel, express themselves in destructive ways, or in socially accepted ways to change, unless they are not heard and then may become destructive later. If the goal is to stay in power, then they should think long term, so that groups are happy and they can stay in power. I want to see policies that change the status quo. What kind of policies? Policies like affirmative action; they really need a psychosocial dimension and not just an economic one. Real leadership means acknowledging mistakes and doing something about it. Not just to do things for people; it has to be co-created. Humiliation in other cultures is perceived differently. Respectful dissent or disagreement is reacted to in various ways, from accepting to fearing to punishing. What can be done to help government policy makers to see that there are less costly ways to bring people on board?

#### **VI. Dignity-Humiliation in the Case of Internally Displaced Persons in Latin America: The Examples of Colombia, Guatemala, Peru, and Mexico (Mercedes Gonzales Jauregui)**

I am in the early phase of a project. It is apparent that 3.7 million people are internally displaced as of 2004 - the most affected are indigenous people. They are victims of discrimination and their cultural identity is seen as inferior. I am looking at UN guiding principles of displaced peoples. National authorities have to facilitate access to displaced people.

## **VII. Compassion, Dignity and Peace Education: A Case Study from Children of War, Inc. (Judith Thompson)**

I am involved in an organization called Children of War, creating an empathetic context to look at justice issues. Book-findings in neuroscience show that empathy and the desire for affiliation can override fear. What is needed are rituals that uncover vulnerability by establishing secure social bonds. Interest in compassion was born out of Children of War. Empathy and compassion are not the same thing in my mind. Compassion is born when there is more fully a sense of others' dignity. From Victim to Visionary created a context to explore grief, a need to mourn, have a cognitive base, all in the process of learning about communication techniques within a multicultural group. Compassion is about a relationship to suffering that is transformative to joy. Compassion puts together vulnerability with awe, gratitude and joy.

### **Discussion on "Can the Notion of Humiliation be Useful for Public Policy Planning? What Can We Envisage as Best Practice Models?"**

Judith Thompson - It is important to look at how to take certain processes and things that have been learned at the micro level and put them at a more macro level.

South African participant - We can have an education process in gaining social and emotional processes and consciousness. It depends on how our leadership is informed.

UN participant – It is important for us to find a result that does not inflict shame.

Howard Zehr - I think we need a legal system, and that it be as restorative as possible. We need to find restorative processes. What do we do when there are traditions?

Alan Klein - How does one get the courage to address this issue? Majorities are the ones that need to make it "cool," make it that coexistence is good business, and that there are benefits. What is needed is enough people.

Grace Feuerverger - The underlying question is "what is meaning?" What does it symbolize? It is a lot bigger than the village itself. We need to give more credit, and need to affirm it.

Merle Lefkoff – I turned to "hard science." I was looking for a new language. Restorative justice is a profound new term. How much do we have to think about?

Howard Zehr – I think language is important. There are dilemmas of how and who we are speaking to. Transformative justice. Victim-offender: how do you go about business without language? Metaphors are important. Commodity language in justice goes as "get justice," "need justice." Rupert Ross chapter is interesting, about language and where it takes you.

Jean Berchmans Ndayizigiye – We should be concerned with how we think about how we are here in the world. Are we immersed in it, or coming from it? Leaders combine

action and reflection. How can we here come together to create a new culture of combining action and reflection? What can we do to create a cultural synthesis to emerge with a kind of reflection to bring us to the kind of society and leadership we need?

Gay Rosenblum-Kumar - Some people can work without regard to their own safety, but we need personal and emotional safety. We should have room to create safe spaces where they can dialogue. We all need more safe spaces.

Jean Berchmans Ndayizigiye – Perhaps we should speak of the majority who are oppressed as opposed to the minority who do the oppressing. The crimes leading to genocide are not treated in the international tribunal.

Gay Rosenblum-Kumar - Rather than turn the other cheek, love your enemy enough that you do not want them to remain in that ignorance. Make it so you can engage with them.

---

Unconfirmed See page 1

***Can the Notion of Humiliation be Useful for Public Policy Planning? What can we Envisage as Best Practice Models?(Round Table 3; Section 2)***

This Section discusses the following topics:

- I. Reflection on Policy and Humiliation: Addressing the Needs of Poor Minority Children in New Jersey's Public Schools
- II. The Subversion of the Colonial System of Humiliation: A Case Study of the Gandhian Strategy
- III. Reconciliation as Policy: Moving Beyond the Victim-Perpetrator Lens in the United Nations Secretariat and Member States
- IV. Mediated Humiliations: Spectacles of Power in Postmodern Culture
- V. Addressing Humiliation through Listening with Respect: A Restorative Justice Model for Victims, Offenders, and Law Enforcement
- VI. Humiliation, Retaliation, and Violence
- VII.

**I. Reflection on Policy and Humiliation: Addressing the Needs of Poor Minority Children in New Jersey's Public Schools (Philip Brown)**

I work with the Center for Character Education at Rutgers. The bulk of my career has been spent in state agencies in PA and NJ. Sometimes I was executing others' orders, other times trying to make changes. NJ is one of the two wealthiest states in the country, yet with 15% of children living in poverty, this is a large disparity. In 1875 NJ constitution was amended so that the legislature would be responsible for ensuring equitable education. In 1997, in the 4<sup>th</sup> NJ Supreme court (Abbot v. Burke case) the consequence was that they did not look at the effect of professionals being removed from decision making yet still responsible for enforcing. They slipped up in the part of defining what values are a part of civil society. I have learned to make alliances in order to form policy opportunities to gradually hammer away.

**II. The Subversion of the Colonial System of Humiliation: A Case Study of the Gandhian Strategy (Rina Kashyap)**

I seek to discuss the psychological pathologies of the colonizers. Ideological hegemony is almost a humanitarian act. English is becoming a language of power – it has rendered the majority of Indians without political voice, and required interpreters to voice their concerns. In the interpretation, the nuances were lost. Gandhi wanted to get the vernacular to become the language of instruction. The colonized imitate the colonizer. Imitation is not the answer since you can never get out of the color of your own skin. Privileging the culture of critique demands self-criticism from fellow Indians. Clothes can be a cultural model - Ghandi making a fashion statement - non-violence as response to the hyper masculine; feminity superior to masculinity. Truth, openness, weaponless: the humiliated changed the rules of the game.

### **III. Reconciliation as Policy: Moving Beyond the Victim-Perpetrator Lens in the United Nations Secretariat and Member States (Sarah Sayeed)**

I am working with a certificate program for UN leaders to deal with conflict. Training is based on a certificate program. First you have to pay attention to the importance of personal transformation - as a precursor or concurrent step. Pay attention to the role of emotion in conflict. In developing a leadership-style policy, pay attention to the personal transformation and emotion. We should make policy in terms of a 200 years present; 100 years before and 100 years ahead. This vision would be able to create a global group of practitioners. The website Global-leader.org has case studies and information about the program. They are looking at policy, thinking from a communication perspective. We need to think about what policy is, and need to think about it in an expanded way, using dialogue and advocacy approaches. Neither is a panacea. We need to think about complementary ways to use these. In the case of disaster, do we want a clear line of command? There are some situations when an asymmetry may be ideal. Ensuring basic human rights, wanting to transform asymmetry, takes time. We need to find ways of making sure respect and basic human rights are maintained within the asymmetry.

### **IV. Mediated Humiliations: Spectacles of Power in Postmodern Culture (Myra Mendible)**

Ignoring popular culture forums is detrimental. Popular Culture demarcates who is in and who is out, who is enemy and who is not, what is popular and what is not. I am taking a look at popular culture and foreign policy. I am interested in the visual aspect of this. The role of the witness: who do we identify with and why, who is perceived as the antagonist/protagonist and why? With the rise of cinema in the 20<sup>th</sup> century there has been a rise of humiliation (e.g. Rise of a Nation- African American humiliation). Visual representations of the Vietnam War are ironic insofar as we are the victims in the tale of Vietnam. Reality TV has become humiliation TV. Humiliation is now popular in our culture.

### **V. Addressing Humiliation through Listening with Respect: A Restorative Justice Model for Victims, Offenders, and Law Enforcement (Ariel Lublin)**

The last three years have consisted of group facilitations. I grew up living in two sets of values and appreciating that many different values are valid ways of living in the world. Meeting with each group, I first think about other groups and what they might think, and also how to communicate with them. They emphasize relationship building prior to problem solving. With victims at one side of table, and offenders at other side, the police jump in and confirm that the situation is bad. When everyone is mixed at the table they are changed parties: with some people referred by the courts, and some people voluntarily there - all members of the community. Community members started feeling much more compassion, and then - feeling respected - offenders could understand better how it felt to be in a community. People frequently stayed past their required time to be there.

## **VI. Humiliation, Retaliation, and Violence (Neil Altman)**

In the Middle East every act of retaliation led to further acts of violence. How is it that people are not seeing this? How is it that people are oblivious to the cycle of violence? People are willing to kill and die to protect dignity. Both sides are feeling humiliated and the easiest way to not feel that is to humiliate the other. This creates an illusory sense of power. Once it is started, cycles of sadism take off in addition to humiliation. Torture is counter-productive; people will say anything to make torture stop. Torture may not be useful, but it sure feels good (the sadistic element coming in), and it almost does not matter that torture is not useful. What is entailed in breaking out of vicious circles? The only hope that I see in all this is Gandhi. Some of what Rina mentioned in terms of actions that show the oppressor is of a similar nature to what I am doing. There is productive shame, and counterproductive shame. Reflection on what one has done can be productive, so long as it is done in a way in which one feels in control of that.

### **Discussion on “Can the Notion of Humiliation be Useful for Public Policy Planning? What Can We Envisage as Best Practice Models?”**

Rina Kashyap - Gandhi said that it would work anywhere and everywhere with one exception. If there is a choice between violence and cowardice, be violent. Whenever we want dialogue and democracy, it requires non-violence.

Ariel Lublin - It seems we are transforming narratives of humiliation into narratives of mutual respect. The Senoy dream people of Malaysia are a society based on working with dreams. For conscious control of dreaming, there was series of instructions for dealing with monsters in bad dream. 1. ask what the monster wants. 2. fight and win. 3. if you cannot win, be eaten 4. under no circumstances are you to flee.

Myra Mendible – Both language and value systems depend on your definition of power; this becomes embedded in the structures of language.

Floyd Rudmin – I would like to think that in future readings, can you make a taxonomy of humiliation - so many approaches can not say one is right or wrong. How would you generalize method or make it generalizable? How do you know you are not doing blood letting? Can you think of some way of knowing what you did really worked?

Merle Lefkoff – I started working with physicists and mathematicians to see if there were any ways to simulate the environment and test different ways and interventions.

Ariel Lublin - Systems of dialogue improve perspective on self and other, other systems are about coming to closure on a dialogue. Certain things are very measurable, some are not.

Sophie Schaarschmidt - Retaliation can serve a function; it may not necessarily be positive, but it is a function.

Neil Altman - Violence is a quick fix. The parent who abuses his/her child cannot tolerate that feeling of helplessness.

Sophie Schaarschmidt - How can we address this in terms of policy making?

Neil Altman – We need to be thinking more about individual levels. It is easier to talk to individuals. It is harder to talk to groups. Feminist movement is good example - what if women's movement can come from men.

Phil Brown - Concerning ethical values in schools; the next step in using disciplinary action is determining which core ethical values you violated (e.g. failed to show respect). This is another form that invites teachers to recognize positive behavior.

Judith Thompson – The invitation to look at popular culture is important. E.g. of Tuki Williams and Bono. Panel at Annenberg school on the Media - *Countdown to Confrontation*: the media was preparing people to know that we are going to war.

Grace Feuerverger – The film *Crash* was a film about how humiliation causes violence and causes us to think about what intervention could prevent violence.

Sarah Sayeed – The film *Paradise Now* is also one to examine.

Ana Ljubinkovic – The relationship between refugees and UN staff is worth noting. Some parts of UN culture are arrogant toward refugees. Some teased a woman because she covered her head, and called her Miss Sensitive. To protect themselves they have to cut themselves off, and remove empathy because they see so much suffering.

Evelin - Building relationships is the most important task we have. Mutual respect is essential. Our first concern is keeping relationships in a constructive mode. Never concentrate on contents first. Contents are secondary. Without our group, our relationships, there is no work. Quiet long-term work is like letting a forest grow - it is easy to cut it down - noisy and quick. We, in our HumanDHS network, are always very protective of the “forest,” and hope that there are enough people who understand this and that contents, controversy, etc. are secondary. I am always afraid that there will be someone at a conference who “cuts down” the relationships that we worked so hard to grow. I try to be in the mode of awe and wonderment that Don speaks about. I appreciate you, appreciate that we are together, and appreciate forest growing - this is what inspires me. This keeps me going toward a not-yet-defined future. I am always afraid and fearful, but at the same time always try to live in the moment. Meaning is there now.